Preface 3

Summary 5

Notation and Nomenclature 19

1 Introduction 21

1.1 Rationale 21

1.2 Contributions of the Thesis 22

1.3 Thesis Outline 23

1.3.1 Part I: Design 23

1.3.2 Part II: Operation 24

Part I: Design 25

2 Distillation Theory 27

2.1 Introduction 28

2.2 Fundamentals 29

2.2.1 The Equilibrium Stage Concept 29

2.2.2 Vapour-Liquid Equilibrium (VLE) 29

2.2.3 K-values and Relative Volatility 31

2.2.4 Estimating the Relative Volatility From Boiling Point Data . 32

2.2.5 Material Balance on a Distillation Stage 34

2.2.6 Assumption about Constant Molar Flows 36

2.3 The Continuous Distillation Column 36

2.3.1 Degrees of Freedom in Operation of a Distillation Column . 37

2.3.2 External and Internal Flows 38

2.3.3 McCabe-Thiele Diagram 38

2.3.4 Typical Column Profiles — Not optimal feed location 40

2.4 Simple Design Equations 41

2.4.1 Minimum Number of Stages — Infinite Energy 41

2.4.2 Minimum Energy Usage — Infinite Number of Stages 42

2.4.3 Finite Number of Stages and Finite Reflux 43

2.4.4 Constant K-values — Kremser Formulas 44

2.4.5 Approximate Formula with Constant Relative Volatility . . . 45
2.4.6 Optimal Feed Location 47
2.4.7 Summary for Continuous Binary Columns 48
2.5 Multicomponent Distillation — Underwood's Method 51
2.5.1 The Basic Underwood Equations 51
2.5.2 Stage to Stage Calculations 53
2.5.3 Some Properties of the Underwood Roots 54
2.5.4 Minimum Energy — Infinite Number of Stages 55
2.6 Further Discussion of Specific Issues 58
2.6.1 The Energy Balance and Constant Molar Flows 58
2.6.2 Calculating Temperature when Using Relative Volatilities . 60
2.6.3 Discussion and Caution 62
2.7 Bibliography 62

3 Analytic Expressions and Visualization of Minimum Energy Consumption in Multicomponent Distillation: A Revisit of the Underwood Equations. 63

3.1 Introduction 64
3.1.1 Background 64
3.1.2 Problem Definition - Degrees of Freedom 65
3.2 The Underwood Equations for Minimum Energy 65
3.2.1 Some Basic Definitions 65
3.2.2 Definition of Underwood Roots 66
3.2.3 The Underwood Roots for Minimum Vapour Flow 67
3.2.4 Computation Procedure 68
3.2.5 Summary on Use of Underwood's Equations 72
3.3 The Vmin-diagram (Minimum Energy Mountain) 73
3.3.1 Feasible Flow Rates in Distillation 74
3.3.2 Computation Procedure for the Multicomponent Case 75
3.3.3 Binary Case 75
3.3.4 Ternary Case 78

3.3.5 Five Component Example 81
3.3.6 Simple Expression for the Regions Under the Peaks 82
3.4 Discussion 83
3.4.1 Specification of Recovery vs. Composition 83
3.4.2 Behaviour of the Underwood Roots 83
3.4.3 Composition Profiles and Pinch Zones 85
3.4.4 Constant Pinch-zone Compositions (Ternary Case) 85
3.4.5 Invariant Multicomponent Pinch-zone Compositions 89
3.4.6 Pinch Zones for V>Vmin 90
3.4.7 Finite Number of Stages 90
3.4.8 Impurity Composition with Finite Number of Stages 92
3.5 Summary 92
3.6 References 93

4 Minimum Energy for Three-product Petlyuk Arrangements 95

4.1 Introduction 96
4.2 Background 97
4.2.1 Brief Description of the Underwood Equations 97
4.2.2 Relation to Previous Minimum Energy Results 98
4.2.3 The Vmin-diagram for Conventional Columns 99
4.3 The Underwood Equations Applied to Directly Coupled Sections . . 100
4.3.1 The Petlyuk Column Prefractionator 100
4.3.2 Composition Profiles 101
4.3.3 Reverse Net Flow of Components 102
4.3.4 Reverse Flow Effects on the Underwood Roots 104
4.4 “Carry Over” Underwood Roots in Directly Coupled Columns 105
4.5 Vmin-Diagram for Directly Coupled Columns 108
4.6 Minimum Energy of a Ternary Petlyuk Arrangement 110
4.6.1 Coupling Column C22 with Columns C21 and C1 110
4.6.2 Visualization in the Vmin-diagram 112

4.6.3 Nonsharp Product Specifications 115
4.6.4 The Flat Optimality Region 115
4.7 Improved 2nd Law Results in Petlyuk Arrangements 117
4.8 Minimum Energy with Multicomponent Feed 118
4.8.1 The General Rule 119
4.8.2 Example: Sharp Component Splits in Products 119
4.8.3 Example: Nonsharp Product Split 121
4.9 Discussion 122
4.9.1 The Conventional Reference 122
4.9.2 Extra Condenser or Reboiler in the Prefractionator 123
4.9.3 Use of a Conventional Prefractionator Column 125
4.9.4 Heat Integration 125
4.9.5 The Two-Shell Agrawal Arrangement 126
4.9.6 A Simple Stage Design Procedure 126
4.9.7 Possible Reduction of Stages 127
4.9.8 Short Note on Operation and Control 129
4.10 Conclusion 130
4.11 References 131

5 Minimum Energy for Separation of Multicomponent Mixtures in Directly Coupled Distillation Arrangements 135
5.1 Introduction 136
5.2 Four Components and Four Products 137
5.2.1 Extended Petlyuk Arrangement 137
5.2.2 Minimum Vapour Flow Expressions 138
5.2.3 Visualization in the Vmin-Diagram 140
5.2.4 The Highest Peak Determines the Minimum Vapour Flow 142
5.2.5 Composition at the Junction C21-C22-C32 143
5.2.6 Flows at the Feed Junction to C32 144
5.2.7 Composition Profile - Simulation Example 145
5.3 Minimum Energy for N Components and M Products 146

5.3.1 Vmin for N Feed Components and N Pure Products 147
5.3.2 General Vmin for N Feed Components and M Products . . . 148
5.4 Verification of the Minimum Energy Solution 150
5.4.1 Minimum Vapour Flow as an Optimization Problem 151
5.4.2 Requirement for Feasibility 151
5.4.3 Verification of The Optimal Solution 152
5.4.4 Summary of the Verification 155
5.4.5 The Optimality Region 156
5.5 Discussion 157
5.5.1 Arrangement Without Internal Mixing 157
5.5.2 Practical Petlyuk Arrangements (4-product DWC). 159
5.5.3 Heat Exchangers at the Sidestream Junctions 162
5.5.4 The Kaibel column or the “ column” 163
5.5.5 Required Number of Stages - Simple Design Rule 163
5.5.6 Control 164
5.6 Conclusion 164
5.7 References 165

6 Minimum Energy Consumption in Multicomponent Distillation 169

6.1 Introduction 170
6.1.1 Some Terms 170
6.1.2 Basic Assumptions 171
6.1.3 Minimum Entropy Production (2nd law efficiency) 172
6.1.4 Minimum Energy (1st law) 173
6.1.5 Summary of some Computation Examples 174
6.2 The Best Adiabatic Arrangement Without Internal Heat Exchange . 176
6.2.1 Direct Coupling Gives Minimum Vapour Flow 176
6.2.2 Implications for Side-Strippers and Side-Rectifiers 179
6.2.3 The Adiabatic Petlyuk Arrangement is Optimal 179
6.3 Entropy Production in Adiabatic Arrangements 180

6.3.1 Adiabatic Column (Section) 180
6.3.2 Adiabatic Petlyuk Arrangements 181
6.4 Reversible Distillation 182
6.4.1 The Reversible Petlyuk Arrangement 183
6.4.2 Comparing Reversible and Adiabatic Arrangements 187
6.5 A Case Study: Petlyuk Arrangements with Internal Heat Exchange 188
6.5.1 Example 0: Theoretical Minimum Energy Limit 188
6.5.2 Example 1: Internal Heat Exchange in the Reversible Arrangement 188
6.5.3 Example 2: Heat Exchange Across the Dividing Wall 189
6.5.4 Example 3: Pre-heating of the Feed by Heat Exchange with the Sidestream 190
6.5.5 Summary of The Examples 191
6.6 Operation at Several Pressure Levels 192
6.6.1 Example 1: Feed Split (Binary Case) 192
6.6.2 Example 2: Double Effect Direct Split (DEDS) 193
6.6.3 Example 3: Double Effect Prefractionator Column (DEPC) 194
6.6.4 Relation to the Petlyuk Column and the Vmin-diagram . . . 194
6.7 Discussion 196
6.7.1 Plant-wide Issues 196
6.7.2 Heat Exchange at the Sidestream Stages 196
6.7.3 Non-Uniqueness of Heat Supply in Reversible Columns . . 197
6.7.4 Practical Issues 199
6.8 Conclusion 199
6.9 References 200
6.10 Appendix: Reversible Distillation Theory 201
6.10.1 Temperature-Composition-Pressure Relationship 202
6.10.2 The Reversible Vapour Flow Profile 203
6.10.3 Entropy Production in a Reversible Section 204
6.10.4 Reversible Binary Distillation 205

Part II: Operation 209

7 Optimal Operation of Petlyuk Distillation: Steady-State Behaviour 211

7.1 Introduction . . . 212
7.2 The Petlyuk Column Model . . . 215
7.3 Optimization Criterion . . . 216
7.3.1 Criterion with State Space Model . . . 217
7.4 Results From the Model Case Study . . . 218
7.4.1 Optimal Steady State Profiles . . . 218
7.4.2 The Solution Surface . . . 220
7.4.3 Effect of Disturbances . . . 222
7.4.4 Transport of Components . . . 222
7.5 Analysis from Model with Infinite Number of Stages . . . 224
7.5.1 Minimum Energy Consumption for a Petlyuk Column. . . . 225
7.5.2 Solution Surface for Infinite Number of Stages . . . 226
7.5.3 Analyzing the Effect of the Feed Enthalpy . . . 230
7.5.4 How Many Degrees of Freedom Must we Adjust During Operation? . . . 230
7.5.5 Sensitivity to Disturbances and Model Parameters . . . 233
7.5.6 A Simple Control Strategy with one Degree of Freedom Fixed . . . 233
7.5.7 Liquid Fraction: Bad Disturbance or Extra Degree of Freedom? . . . 234
7.5.8 Relations to Composition Profiles . . . 234
7.6 Candidate Feedback Variables . . . 236
7.6.1 Position of Profile in Main Column (Y1). . . . 236
7.6.2 Temperature Profile Symmetry (Y2) . . . 237
7.6.3 Impurity of Prefractionator Output Flows (Y3,Y4) . . . 238
7.6.4 Prefractionator Flow Split (Y5) . . . 238
7.6.5 Temperature Difference over Prefractionator (Y6) . . . 241
7.6.6 Evaluation Of Feedback Candidates . . . 243

7.7 Conclusions 243
7.8 Acknowledgements 243
7.9 References 243
7.10 Appendix 244
7.10.1 Model Equations for the Finite Dynamic Model 244
7.10.2 Analytic Expressions for Minimum Reflux 246
7.10.3 Mapping V(b,L1) to V(Rl,Rv) 249

8 Use of Short-cut Methods to Analyse Optimal Operation of Petlyuk Distillation Columns 251

8.1 Introduction 252
8.2 The Petlyuk Distillation Column 252
8.3 Computations with Infinite Number of Stages 253
8.4 Results with the Analytical Methods or some Separation Cases . . . 256
8.4.1 When do we get the Largest Savings with the Petlyuk Column? 256
8.4.2 Sensitivity to Changes in Relative Volatility Ratio and Liquid Fraction 258
8.4.3 When Can we Obtain Full Savings with Constant Vapour and Liquid Splits? 258
8.5 A Simple Procedure to Test the Applicability for a Petlyuk Arrangement 260
8.6 CONCLUSION 261
8.7 ACNOWLEDGEMENT 261
8.8 REFERENCES 261

9 Optimal Operating Regions for the Petlyuk Column - Nonsharp Specifications 263

9.1 Introduction 264
9.2 The Basic Methods 265
9.2.1 The Underwood Equations 265
9.2.2 The Vmin-Diagram 266
9.2.3 The Vmin-diagram Applied to the Petlyuk Arrangement . . 266

9.2.4 The Optimality Region for Sharp Product Splits 267
9.3 Non-Sharp Product Specifications 268
9.3.1 Relation Between Compositions, Flows and Recoveries . . . 268
9.4 Minimum Vapour Flow for Non-Sharp Product Specifications 269
9.5 The Optimality Region 272
9.5.1 Possible Impurity Paths to the Sidestream 272
9.5.2 The Optimality Region for Case 1 273
9.5.3 Net Flow of Heavy C into Top of Column C22 275
9.5.4 Optimality Regions for Case 3 276
9.5.5 Optimality region for Case 2 (Balanced Main Column) . . . 277
9.5.6 Effect of the Feed Composition 277
9.5.7 Sensitivity to Impurity Specification-Example 278
9.6 Operation Outside the Optimality Region 278
9.6.1 The Solution Surface - Simulation Example 279
9.6.2 Characteristics of the Solution 280
9.6.3 Four Composition Specifications 281
9.6.4 Failure to Meet Purity Specifications 283
9.7 Conclusions 284
9.8 References 284
9.9 Appendix:
Alternative Proof of the Optimality Region for Case 1 285

10 Self-Optimizing Control:
Local Taylor Series Analysis **287**

10.1 Introduction 288
10.1.1 The Basic Idea 288
10.2 Selecting Controlled Variables for Optimal Operation 289
10.2.1 The Performance Index (cost) J 289
10.2.2 Open-loop Implementation 291
10.2.3 Closed-loop Implementation 292
10.2.4 A Procedure for Output Selection (Method 1) 294

10.3 Local Taylor Series Analysis 296
    10.3.1 Expansion of the Cost Function 296
    10.3.2 The Optimal Input 298
    10.3.3 Expansion of the Loss Function 299
    10.3.4 Loss With Constant Inputs 299
    10.3.5 Loss with Constant Controlled Outputs 300
    10.3.6 Loss Formulation in Terms of Controlled Outputs 301
    10.3.7 “Ideal” Choice of Controlled Outputs 302
10.4 A Taylor-series Procedure for Output Selection 303
10.5 Visualization in the Input Space 305
10.6 Relationship to Indirect and Partial Control 307
10.7 Maximizing the Minimum Singular Value (Method 2) 310
    10.7.1 Directions in the Input Space 311
    10.7.2 Analysis in the Output Space 312
10.8 Application Examples 313
    10.8.1 Toy Example 313
    10.8.2 Application to a Petlyuk Distillation Column 314
10.9 Discussion 316
    10.9.1 Trade-off in Taylor Series Analysis 316
    10.9.2 Evaluation of Loss 316
    10.9.3 Criterion Formulation with Explicit Model Equations 317
    10.9.4 Active Constraint Control 318
    10.9.5 Controllability Issues 319
    10.9.6 Why Separate into Optimization and Control 319
10.10References 320

11 Evaluation of self-optimising control structures for an integrated Petlyuk distillation column 323

11.1 Introduction 324
11.2 Energy Optimization in the Petluyk Column 324
11.3 Optimising Control Requirement for the Petlyuk Column 325

11.4 Self-optimising Control for the Petlyuk Column 326

11.5 Self-optimising Control:
A Petlyuk Column Case Study 327

11.5.1 The Nominal Optimal Solution 327

11.5.2 Proposed Output Feedback Variables 328

11.6 Robustness Study Simulation 329

11.7 Discussion of the Results 330

11.8 Conclusions 331

11.9 References 331

12 Conclusions and Further Work 335

12.1 Contributions 335

12.2 Further Work 337

12.2.1 Process Design 337

12.2.2 Control Structure Design 337

12.2.3 Advanced Control 338

12.3 Postscript 338

A Prefractionator Pinch Zone Compositions 339

B Alternative Deduction of Minimum Energy in a Petlyuk Arrangement Based on Pinch Zone Compositions 342

C Minimum Energy with a Separate Prefractionator Column 344

D Minimum Energy of a Petlyuk Arrangement based on Rigorous Simulation 348